A PARTICIPATORY MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE ROSE TOWN CONSTRUCTION INTERNSHIP PROGRAMME

Gore Family Foundation, Gore Developments Ltd.



"Give our young people a fighting chance, because they deserve it"









DISCLAIMER:

"This document was prepared by Jennifer Jones and should in no way be considered to represent the views and opinions of the Gore Family Foundation"

Prepared by Jennifer Jones
<u>jennyjones33@gmail.com</u>
Site Photographs by Jamin Levy
<u>jaminlevy@gmail.com</u>
Classroom Photograph by Akino Lindsay

Table of Contents

Acronyms	3
Introduction	4
Skills Training for Youth under HOPE.	4
Background - The Rose Town Construction Internship Project (RTCIP)	6
Selection Process	6
The Setting	7
Internship Rules	8
The Theoretical Courses	8
The Practical 'Hands-on' Learning	9
Exposure to another Jamaica, outside the inner city	9
Support	9
Certification	9
The Evaluation Method – Participatory Evaluation	10
Key Findings	13
1. The Learning Environment is a comfortable welcoming technologically environment	
2. An Online Learning Process is an appropriate learning process for the i	nterns22
3. At the end of the course the trainee outcome should be a mature individ for the working world	ual, ready
4. They must have mastery of more than one construction skill	25
Results and Recommendations	27
How effective has this programme been?	28
Recommendations	32
Conclusion	37
Final Recommendations	38
Appendix 1: List of Interviewees	39
Appendix 2: Extract from "Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facil transition to work", ILO Working Paper, 2004	_

Acronyms

ANSI American National Standards Institute

CAPE Caribbean Proficiency Advanced Examination

CSEC Caribbean Secondary Education Certificate

ECC Early Childhood Commission

FGD Focus Group Discussion
GFF Gore Family Foundation

HEART Human Employment and Resource Training

HOPE Housing, Opportunity, Production, and Employment,

HR Human Resource
IC Intern Coordinator

JSM Junior Security Manager
KOL Kingston Online Learning
KPH Kingston Public Hospital
NCB National Commercial Bank

NCTVET National Council on Technical and Vocational Training and Education

NGO Non-Government Organisation

NSTA National Service and Training Agency

OPM Office of the Prime Minister
PMI Peace Management Initiative

RTCIP Rose Town Construction Internship Programme

RTF Rose Town Foundation

UK United Kingdom

US United States

UTECH University of Technology
UWI University of the West Indies

Introduction

The Phillip and Christine Gore Family Foundation (GFF) started in 2001. In that year Christine Gore closed her successful legal practice in order to lead this joint husband and wife initiative. Why? "We are passionate about Jamaica and its people... We want Jamaica to prosper, we want to contribute to national development – to do something instead of complaining... We have run a successful business so we are arrogant enough to think that maybe the principles we use to succeed here can be used in other fields."

The GFF has been through several phases but has always focused on children and youth from Jamaica's inner cities, those who have been raised in poor, underprivileged and often volatile, violent communities. Their intention has always been to "make a difference in the lives of these children...give hope to these youth." GFF's ongoing activities include annual university scholarships to the University of the West Indies (UWI), Mona, the University of Technology (UTECH) and Mico University College and support for nine basic schools serving vulnerable children in Central Kingston and the Liguanea area. These were assigned to them by the Early Childhood Commission (ECC). Early Childhood Education is the primary focus of their philanthropy because of the critical importance of the years from 3 to 5 in a child's life in laying the foundation for development in later years. This is even more vital if children are not being raised in optimal circumstances: "Focusing on children 0–5 years, especially those vulnerable children in danger of falling off the typical developmental trajectory, is an insurance policy."

Skills Training for Youth under HOPE.

In 2018, in response to a request from HEART NSTA (Human Employment and Resource Training/National Service Training Agency) to partner with them in a construction skills training programme as part of the HOPE (Housing, Opportunity, Production and Employment) Programme out of the Office of the Prime Minister (OPM), GFF came on board. They handed out cheques and stipends and two of their construction sites in Granville, St. James, and Portmore in St. Catherine were used for the practical training for 25 trainees in each. In Granville they converted and repurposed a model unit to hold online courses and hired a teacher to support the learning. Realising these young people also needed individual counselling and mentorship, Mrs. Gore took this on, although she soon realised that it is by no means optimal for one person to mentor 50 trainees.

The Gores found this venture a disappointing experience, which to them conveyed a lack of interest by those involved in providing first class training for the trainees. The fact that only a small room had been put aside by the HEART representative in St. James for life skills training suggested a low priority was placed on this aspect, which is considered critical by GFF. In Portmore the computers were not initially in use as they needed repair. In the view of two of

¹ https://developingchild.harvard.edu/resources/inbrief-the-impact-of-early-adversity-on-childrens-development-video/. The Center on the Developing Child at Harvard University has produced major work on how the architecture of the brain develops in early childhood.

the interviewees for this Evaluation, one being Mrs. Gore, HEART NSTA training is not well considered by the private sector. Sandals, for example, does not recruit through HEART – it does its own recruitment and training. Nevertheless 60% of those in St. Catherine who were trained in construction skills under this partnership between HOPE and the GFF have either found jobs or are furthering their education. GFF then offered to train the next batch for HOPE but this offer was not taken up.

Background - The Rose Town Construction Internship Project (RTCIP)

This led GFF to start their own programme. They wanted to help inner city youth who had almost certainly not had the advantage of a good early childhood education, the primary focus of GFF. They could now build on the lessons they had learnt from the partnership with HEART NSTA. They turned to the Rose Town Foundation (RTF), an NGO established in Rose Town well over a decade ago but registered as a charity in 2010, supported by, among others, The Prince's Foundation. The RTF focuses on obtaining land tenure for the residents and also currently runs an education programme and farming programme on land it owns. The GFF already had a relationship with the Rose Town Foundation through 2 previous projects:

- 1. **Sheets for Kington Public Hospital (KPH)**: GFF had obtained sheets from volunteer hotels which would then be cut and sewn into single sheets for use on beds at KPH. A group of women would sew them at the Rose Town Foundation building on sewing machines provided by GFF, while Jamaica National paid for their labour;
- 2. **Pottery Project**, supporting a group of individuals with materials to develop their own small business enterprise making flowerpots and other items. The enterprise developed still continues.

Selection Process

The interns were recruited and selected through the Rose Town Foundation (RTF), who were delighted for this opportunity for Rose Town youth. The process began in February of 2021 with RTF advertising this opportunity through fliers and through the monthly community meetings that it holds. In the selection process particular attention had to be paid to a sensitive issue: Rose Town is a divided community – between Upper Rose Town and Lower Rose Town – and has been so for years. At times the division has lessened, most notably through the courageous leadership of Michael Black from Lower Rose Town, who began the Rose Town Benevolent Society; he was assisted by a strong Upper Rose Town woman, Angela Brown, who led a women's group there. Mr. Black tragically died in his early 50s from natural causes and Ms. Brown has since migrated. Rose Town Foundation, originally located in Lower Rose Town, took over a building in the No Man's Land neutral area, razed of most of its buildings from the violence - a building originally known as 'The Cemetery'. This was a place where dead bodies were left for the police to later remove.

It was therefore critical that applicants were finally selected from both ends of the community. This was achieved, not in exactly equal numbers but in a balance that satisfied the community residents, who are always alert for any signs of favouritism, whether real or suspected.

Forty young men and young women from both ends of the community applied. They had to pass a police security check, a psychosocial assessment by a psychologist, and numeracy and literacy tests by KOL (Kingston Online Learning) Academy. In the end 15 passed all the tests, eight males and seven females, although there were places for 20. Mr. Jason McKay offered eight others training for security work, including martial arts training over a month,

and a guaranteed job if they passed. McKay Security has high standards and their training is a rigorous process. Six of the eight made it through to the end; but one by one five of the six dropped out. In Mr. McKay's experience it is hard for inner city youth to deal with the discipline needed to get up every morning, to be punctual, to work long hours. This kind of discipline, required for the world of work, is one of the outcomes the Construction Internship Training wants the trainees to achieve.

Most of the young people selected would not be considered the most at risk in Rose Town, not in the first line of recruitment for the Rose Town gangs, although all suffer the pressures of living in a poor and violent environment with its other social problems. The experience of NGOs like the Peace Management Initiative (PMI), working in inner city areas, is that those most at risk of joining gangs are male school dropouts, even though no young man living in a volatile inner city area like Rose Town is potentially exempt. Young women can also be recruited or become girlfriends of gang members. The latter position offers them great security, although the cost they pay can be high.²

Those selected had all successfully completed high school or were in their last year, so they would not be categorised as the most at risk youth, who are normally not able to pass a Grade 9 level literacy or numeracy test. All but two had passed or were studying for CSEC exams, or had City and Guilds exams, or a mixture plus some NCTVET courses, while some had completed CAPE. The top girl in academics is 20 years old and has 10 CSEC, six with 1s and four with 2s, as well as 3 CAPE subjects, two with Is in Units 1 & 2, and one with a II and a III – no mean academic feat. She wants to be a pharmacist and intellectually is more than capable as she excels in Chemistry; she should be able to get a scholarship. As shall be seen two of the 15 interns did in fact have connections with gangs – how this worked out shall emerge.

The Setting

So, at the beginning of June 2021, while active cases of COVID-19 were over 22,000 and deaths had risen to almost $1,000^3$, 15 young people – eight young men and seven young women between the ages 16-24 years – left the homes where they were marooned, and were bussed out of their often violent community in air-conditioned comfort to a peaceful setting, a training centre at the Gore Homes Phoenix Park Development in St. Catherine. They all wore one of the 6 polo shirts with Gore Family Foundation insignia on the pocket provided to them, as well as caps. They were about to start the first day of their construction internship programme. At the end of each fortnight they would receive a stipend of \$10,000 or \$1,000 for each day they attended.

In their two air-conditioned classrooms, in a converted 2-bedroom, 2-bathroom scheme house, they each had a computer and earphones for the many online classes they were to take for four days of the week, with one day set aside for practical work. On arrival they were

² Gang members, especially leading members, are known for their brutality. A girlfriend can never leave because she knows too many secrets. If she is suspected of sharing them, she will be killed.

https://www.worldometers.info/coronavirus/country/jamaica/

provided with a snack, a choice of granola bar or instant porridge with orange juice or milo. At lunch they had a cooked meal of meat and rice and a drink in their own outdoor, airy

tarpaulin-covered, canteen (the regular construction workers eat at their site location). The bus picked them up at 7.30 am in Rose Town and their day finished at 4.00 pm when they would be bussed back to Rose Town. For most of the first nine months this is how their days were scheduled.



Internship Rules

Each trainee has to sign to a witnessed

copy of the Partner and Participant Guidelines. The agreement can be terminated by either party by giving the other 48 hours' notice in writing. It includes a 4-page list of minor and major offences. Breaches would carry a financial consequence, the amount depending on the seriousness of the breach, and, if a major breach, a week's suspension. For example, \$1,000 would be deducted for unauthorised absence, \$1,500 for unsatisfactory performance, one week's suspension without stipend for fighting.

These guidelines mandate counselling for interns if they repeat a minor offence such as Inappropriate attire, Late arrival, Unauthorised absence, Using abusive, offensive or indecent language, and Unsatisfactory performance. For major offences counselling is immediately mandatory. A repeat means removal from the programme. The major offences are Fighting, Sexual harassment, Involvement in sexual activities, Falsification of information, Possession or use of offensive weapons, Vandalism/Destruction of property, Disrespect for authority, Smoking.

Between December 2021 and January 2022 one female intern was expelled and two, one male and one female, left the course due to school and exam pressure.

The Theoretical Courses

Mrs. Gore chose online teaching for life skills and construction theory rather than face to face teaching, which would anyway be impractical given the distance of the training venue from Kingston – it is on Salt Pond Road to the west of Spanish Town. The online courses were chosen by a consultant who had just retired from lecturing for many years as part of the academic staff at UWI's Open Campus. This expertise, plus the HOPE experience, where Mrs Gore also introduced online courses, has allowed for an improved selection of courses. The same companies with free courses were used, namely alison.com with some from the UK Open University. They followed the developmental trajectory of the interns, starting with orientation and pre-requisite courses, followed by foundation courses, then moving on to the construction speciality courses. Guest lecturers, most of whom were experts in particular

⁴ Sexual Harassment is defined as the involvement of making unwanted sexual advances or obscene remarks.

⁵ Sexual Activities are defined as penetration/stimulation of genitalia or anus using penis or any other objects and oral sex. Inappropriate touching of the breasts, buttocks, genitalia are also included.

aspects of the construction industry, also come from time to time to share their knowledge and skills in: Real Estate Development, Landscaping, Special Paint Finishes, and in Business Etiquette and Professionalism. After each course the intern had to write a reflection on the course and what they gained from it.

The Practical 'Hands-on' Learning

This took place every Thursday in different construction skills at different sections of the Phoenix Park Development Phase 5 construction site. In mid-February the online theoretical courses had been completed, taking just under 9 months as planned. The interns have now moved into fulltime 5-day-a-week work on a construction site. The intention is that when they graduate they will have mastered more than one skill so they are better placed if they choose to work in the construction industry. In this instance they are building the Community Centre for the Phoenix Park Housing Scheme residents. Their practical work will not be completed after this, however. They will then move to a site in Rose Town for the final 'Live Build' part of the programme, where during one week they will build a decorative wall surrounding the 'Welcome to Rose Town' sign, currently unadorned and beside a pile of garbage. Here they will also be under the supervision of Gore Developments Ltd. with security provided by the police.

Exposure to another Jamaica, outside the inner city

The interns were taken on three daytrips: to Emancipation Park, Hope Gardens and Holywell.

Support

Two trained teachers, female and male, each with over 10 years classroom experience, are in the classrooms with the interns for supervision, academic support, and counselling. In addition, the interns have access to a psychologist for one-on-one counselling by phone, Zoom or face to face. The psychologist also comes once a month for a general session with everyone. Former Gore scholars, some now in jobs, others still in college, most in Jamaica, provide voluntary mentorship to a matched intern.

Certification

Trainees will be eligible for up to three types of certification, once they reach the appropriate standard:

- 1. Certificates for all the online courses that they have passed. Although the courses are free, certificates must be paid for.
- 2. Certification in Construction Skills from Gore Developments Ltd.
- 3. For outstanding graduates, the opportunity to obtain a Driving Licence through a prepaid course in driving.

The Evaluation Method – Participatory Evaluation

The Foundation wants the answer to one question: "How effective has this programme been?"

How can this be measured? Ideally, in the design phase before a programme starts, it should be guided by a framework that includes four components:

- 1. A theory of change (TOC);
- 2. A monitoring and evaluation (M&E) framework, based on this TOC with specific objectives or indicators which would be brainstormed and decided on;
- 3. A baseline against which achievements can be measured;
- 4. Data collected at points in the programme to ascertain if the steps outlined in the M&E towards to these objectives are being followed.⁶

Although this was not written down in a project document, in fact in their minds Christine Gore, who has been the Foundation leader, and Phillip Gore had a theory of change – that young people raised in an inner city environment can be helped to sustainable high-paying employment in the construction industry through a combination of two opportunities: 1) quality skills training; accompanied by 2) effective life skills coaching. Their employment would only offer a sustainable route to high level earnings if their construction skills were matched by an ability to work in a team, to practice internal customer service, to use the social graces needed for employment in the formal sector, and to master their emotions, so that reason takes precedence. Without these life skills jobs in the formal sector would be lost or they would work at low paying levels. These life skills also make for success in self-employment.

All the youth came from an inner city community which all exhibit high levels of unemployment. Community data can only be obtained from community profiles by the Social Development Commission, based on surveys from random samples appropriate to community size. In 2015, for example, while the national unemployment rate was 13.5 %, in Seaview Gardens it was 41% and in Denham Town it was 68%. The unemployment rate is much lower now, about half, so it can be assumed that the inner city rates have reduced but they will still be far above the national rate and are always higher among 14-24 year olds. In October 2021 the average unemployment rate among 14–24 year olds was 19%;⁷ it would be much higher among youth from an inner city area like Rose Town. Youth unemployment is one baseline measurement that could be used if it were available.

The Gores also had clear objectives in the sense that they knew what they wanted and what they did <u>not</u> want, as a result of their experience working with HEART NSTA in the HOPE Programme, which in a way operated as a comparator:

⁶ See CAPRI report "Testing Testing – Challenges to Measuring Social Programmes for At-risk Youth". 2. https://www.capricaribbean.org/archive/202105

⁷ Statistical Institute of Jamaica (STATIN) https://statinja.gov.jm/LabourForce/NewLFS.aspx

- 1. Learning must take place in a comfortable welcoming technologically effective environment not in inadequate spaces for life skills classes or starting in classrooms with broken computers needing repair.
- 2. An Online Learning Process is an appropriate learning process for these interns. It must cover life skills, foundational academics and the theory and processes behind the many skills involved in construction
- 3. At the end of the course the trainee outcome should be a mature individual, ready for the working world, whether or not s/he works in the construction industry (life skills are even more important than the construction skills).
- 4. At the end of the course the trainee should have mastered several construction skills
- 5. Within 6 months of graduation trainees should be in a job or continuing their education in their chosen field.⁸

However nothing was written down and there was no data collection to gather information on the progress of the construction skills training or on the life skills coaching.

So how many of these objectives can a mid-term evaluation assess? It can assess #1; to a large extent it can assess #2; it can assess if trainees have progressed towards #3; it can assess progress towards #4 since the trainees will have been working fulltime on a building site for over a month; it cannot assess #5.

Why has a participatory process been selected as the most appropriate method to conduct this evaluation?

- This project is about the empowerment of young people who have been socially excluded: they live in communities that are at the lowest socioeconomic level; they live in an inner city community, Rose Town, which, like many, is volatile and violent it has three gangs and is divided between upper and lower Rose Town, which means it can be dangerous for some, especially young men, to walk from one end to the other; most have attended schools which are poorly resourced at the secondary level these are the non-traditional high schools, with no long and rich history of wealthy church patronage but supported only by a basic and inadequate government subvention. Their analysis of this 10 months, their evaluation of the process they are involved in is critical. Do they feel they have been empowered?
- This participatory process has involved all the stakeholders who have had a role in this internship. What has been their role in the process and what is their understanding from their perspective, of the trainees' progress? Do they have any recommendations for future programmes if they take place?

The stakeholders were interviewed face to face unless otherwise indicated, as follows:

- 1. Christine Gore, GFF Director who leads the Foundation
- 2. The Executive Director of the Rose Town Foundation for the Built Environment.

 $^{^{8}}$ In an M&E programme a minimum percentage target would be specified.

- 3. The GFF Special Projects Consultant who links with the mentors and supplied the secondary data on GFF as requested.
- 4. The two Intern Coordinators, who also provided secondary data as requested.
- 5. Six of the Mentors in an online focus group discussion
- 6. The Psychologist.
- 7. The Guest Lecturer on business etiquette and social graces online one of the most popular.
- 8. The Junior Security Manager and martial arts instructor who supervises the interns in the chartered bus to and from the building site and is on site all day.
- 9. Six out of the seven Male Interns in a focus group discussion
- 10. Two out of the five Female Interns in a focus group discussion, held concurrently.⁹
- 11. The Guest Lecturer on landscaping also very popular
- 12. The Head of the Security Firm that recommended the Junior Security Manager and who provides security for the building site where they learn.
- 13. An experienced Youth Leader in Rose Town and former Violence Interrupter with Peace Management Initiative (PMI).
- 14. The Site Supervisor who usually instructed the interns on their weekly practical day and is now supervising them on the construction site where they are building a community centre.
- 15. Four parents, one father and three mothers, of four students, two young women and two young men, randomly chosen by sex from names on papers picked out of a box.
- 16. The President of the Master Builders Association, as an independent representative of the construction industry.

One of the advantages of this process is that where opinions and views on progress, or lack of it, converge, the Evaluator can have a stronger assurance that the findings are correct. An Evaluator who is brought in eight months after the start of the project is not in a position to independently evaluate the project without this participatory process,

⁹ One had indicated she could not attend as she would be at a funeral

Key Findings

The key findings will be discussed through the objectives identified above:

1. The Learning Environment is a comfortable welcoming technologically effective environment

GFF have provided the interns with a high-tech airconditioned learning environment in a Phoenix Park home converted into a training centre. It has 2 air-conditioned classrooms, with a computer and headphones for each trainee, internet access, a smaller meeting room, which can be used for counselling, two bathrooms, male and female, and a small kitchen with a



microwave. The students are allowed to keep their cell phones with them in the classroom. Mrs. Gore remarks that they "spent a fortune" on the equipment and it no doubt took up a significant portion of the \$17.2m that GFF has spent on this programme.

Learning Support

The interns are supported in doing their online courses by an Intern Coordinator (IC) and an Assistant Intern Coordinator, both trained teachers; the female IC worked alone from June 2021 but was joined in October 2021 by a male teacher, as Assistant Intern Coordinator. The courses are provided via a moodle that enables the ICs, if for example they are in the meeting room, to see exactly what the interns are doing. If there is a technological problem, the ICs immediately contact the firm that set up the system, who also have simultaneous access to it.

Initially the ICs focused on ensuring that the interns got their academic work done and completed their assignments and reflections. Later they realised that the work had to be assessed as well and that extra individualised learning was needed to help an intern to focus on improving on their weaknesses. This might mean using the whiteboard in one of the classrooms to give a lesson in English, e.g. on punctuation or use of capital letters, or maths. Most interns carry with them either a fear of English or a fear of maths.

A written reflection at the end of each course, as well as on the one-day outings, was another addition following the HEART experience. It is a way of helping the intern to revise the course learnings for greater absorption and to practice their writing skills, which most find tedious and hard work, but also, importantly, encourages reflection as a process that benefits self-development. These reflections are marked by the ICs.

This is not the only support the ICs have to give. They estimate that over 50% of their time is spent on mentoring. They try to reinforce positive behaviours like saying Good Morning when entering a classroom at the start of the day. They have to mediate the conflicts which arise from a lot of misunderstandings: for example, a feeling that other interns are "preeing" them, i.e. looking hard at them, staring, not in a friendly way but in order to judge them or find out some secret. Jealousy issues are also often present and need intervention before they lead to serious quarrels.

Then there are times when an intern is grieving over family losses = one youth lost three persons close to him (uncle, cousin, friend) in one month from violence or accidents. He says he is good but he is grieving – at times he is "out of it" in class. More recently the father and stepbrother of a female intern were murdered. She has simply been unable to come back to the Centre and has never started on the building site, even though it would be beneficial to move away from tragic surroundings. It is jeopardising her graduation in construction skills.

In terms of their future the Assistant Coordinator has interviewed each intern and been to considerable lengths to prepare a possible career path based on their desired career(s), their qualifications, the requirements for enrolment at whichever school or university they wish to enter, the cost and the available scholarships. Six out of the 12 remaining have chosen a construction skill among their career choices (most have more than one choice).

Following the Rules

Most, if not all, did not find this easy. There is an adverse reaction, especially among the late teens and early 20s, to being told what to do. It is also connected with the culture of the inner city. Some of the male interns analysed it well in their focus group discussion: "Weh wi come from, wi nuh tek talk from nobody." Another followed with this comment, "Nuff people nuh know how fi mek adjustments. For example, if yuh live a garrison yuh must know dat di rules different when yuh leave 'dere. Most yutes don't realize dat." However there was a view generally, among males and females, that there could have been more emphasis on encouragement. "In the beginning, we didn't benefit - bare punishments. Later dem mek changes. Now wi understand the reasons for di rules. Every month wi get certificate if yuh gwan good."

Psychological/Emotional Support

The Intern Coordinators (ICs).

Inevitably the Coordinators, who are in the classrooms daily with the interns, pick up conversations, feelings, body language. They can sense if an intern has a problem. The Training Centre also has a small meeting room where one-on-one sessions with a Coordinator can be held. They always follow up with the psychologist. She will use Zoom, Google meet, the phone or a face-to-face session. However, as shall be seen, interns are very inhibited when it comes to relating to a psychologist.

The interns think highly of the ICs who "Show real interest inna ghetto yute." They say they guide them when they make mistakes, correct them when they are wrong. However some

express a dislike for "public shaming" and feel interns should be taken aside and their fault explained to them. A discussion on breaches should take place outside of individuals being upbraided in public.

The Psychologist

The role of the psychologist is to provide counselling for the interns as needed and to provide appropriate advice to the Administration. She met the interns first at the Orientation where she went through the Partner and Participant Guidelines with them. As explained, there is mandatory counselling tor interns who have committed major breaches of the code of conduct in the Partner and Participant Guidelines, as well as for repeat of a minor breach.

Unsurprisingly interns have been very slow in voluntarily using the one-to-one service. There is a stigma around counselling – a school student has to have courage if they are to go to the school guidance counsellor individually - worse if someone is going to see a psychologist. There is no comprehension that at certain times in life all of us can be helped by counselling. Instead it can be read as mental illness, rather than, say, chronic depression or overwhelming grief from loss of a loved one. Mental illness is translated to mean 'mad person'; and a 'mad person' is to be shunned and despised. Only one female intern has used one on one counselling with the psychologist to date. ¹⁰ Otherwise it takes place only when it is mandated.

Asked what problems the interns tend have, the psychologist immediately identified the problem of community violence and described its effect on their lives as "heart breaking". The female interns are more likely to express feeling unsafe and talk of the efforts they make to support their family, while the males talk of being expected to protect their family, but not knowing how to, feeling powerless. The experience or apprehension around current community violence inevitably distracts them in the classroom. The coordinators also express great concern about what these young people experience: "Some of the struggles in their life – you are only 18 years and you have experienced all of this? It is heartrending when you hear them talk and see them tending to violence."

Although she has no identifiable accent, the psychologist is Trinidadian. She took one of her several qualifications, a master's in clinical psychology, at UWI Mona. However she agrees that not being able to speak Patois is, as she comments, "inhibitive". In September she started a monthly general session in the Training Centre with all the interns, as the voluntary one-to-one sessions were not taking place, hoping to pick up issues and general dynamics through these sessions. One of the issues the interns need most guidance on, and which she has been able to use these sessions for, is understanding sexual harassment, a concept with which very few are familiar.

Feedback from the interns on the support from the psychologist was mainly favourable. In response to the question: "Do you find it useful to have a counsellor like Tara? Do you use her

¹⁰ The interview with the psychologist was on February 14, 2022, over 8 months since the start of the programme.

to get advice on problems? some said she gave good advice or was "useful" in one on one. For the male interns her very attractive appearance was a plus: "She pretty—coulda look pon har every day." Some were afraid that their discussion with her would not be confidential – that she would pass on information to the administration, hence their shying away from the one-on-one sessions. This may not have anything to do with the psychologist. It is a common fear expressed by students at some schools regarding guidance counsellors; unfortunately in some cases this fear is based on experience. Others felt that the general sessions were not sufficiently stimulating, that she spent too much time waiting on them to talk, rather than provoking them with a current 'hot' topic that they would be interested in.

The Junior Security Manager (JSM)

The Junior Security Manager, from the security firm employed by Gore Family Foundation, who chaperones them on the bus to and from the training centre and site, also ends up providing mentoring to some of the male interns in particular. He is a young man, closer in age to them, a martial arts teacher and competitor with success in international competitions, currently studying part-time¹¹ for a degree in economics. He is in the final stretch and, based on his performance, has been told he has the ability to do a master's. He, himself, was raised in the inner city. He also attests to the violence in the community and its prominence in their lives. Sometimes he has to call them to persuade them to come to the bus – they are afraid to walk, afraid they may be robbed or caught by a stray bullet. The bus route changes from time to time based on the conflicts. How do they cope with the stress? He knows three of the males smoke ganja heavily, and four drink. A few, including the one later expelled, had an entitlement attitude: "The programme couldn't run without me", but he says the majority are very appreciative of the programme. The focus group comments support this:

- "Educational and beneficial."
- "Really, really nice."
- "Fully appreciate it" (in unison male interns).

The male interns in particular think highly of the JSM. They can "reason with him about anything". They are comfortable with him because they say he is like them. He himself says he likes the interaction with them; they remind him of himself when he was younger.

GFF Director

There has also been critical support for the interns from the GFF Lead Director, not only in the programme design on which she worked with her husband, but also in her personal approach to the young people and in her personal assistance at times. She believes in the individuality of each young person; each has their own personality, their own goal, and their own insecurities. She wants to provide an environment in which they can "find their passion in life, know that they are cared for and that their future is personally important to us." She wants them to have the opportunity to grasp a future of hope and wellbeing.

¹¹ As he is able to pay the fees

Mrs. Gore believes discipline is an important part in the guidance of young people "so I am not their friend, I am their parent." As a 'parent', she showed genuine concern early in the programme for a 17-year-old intern who was proving to be a problem and had sexually abused another intern. He had graduated from school with 4 CSECs, including English, but it turned out had ties to a gang. One night soon after the major breach, for which he would have been suspended for a week, he got very drunk and was beaten "to an inch of his life". He was admitted to KPH but Mrs. Gore felt they were not taking good care of him and "I showed him some mercy." She sent him at her own expense to a private doctor and later to a physiotherapist. After what must have been a profound experience for him, his behaviour changed. He was allowed to continue in the programme. He is by no means the most mature intern but has made clear progress.

The Site Supervisor

When it came to the practical site work at the end of February, he slipped back. The Site Supervisor found all the interns difficult in the first few days. By the time an hour was up, they had left the site, which indeed becomes hot like a furnace (this area in St. Catherine is very dry) and had gone back to the a/c in the classrooms. 12 The Supervisor had to talk to them - he is a skilled teacher who understands their background and culture as he says he also comes from a "ghetto" in the community close by- and explain to them why "This can't work!" He is someone who makes it very clear to them when they are doing the wrong thing, but with no judgment in his tone. They soon fell in line except for the same 17-year-old. A few days after the supervisor sent him off the site and told him not to come back. Ten minutes later he came back and apologised, "close to tears". He has made a turn-around since. The supervisor takes time out to talk to each of them and learn about their life and problems. It turns out that this youth lives alone. "How do you survive?" "My mother sends food for me." "Who has guided you?" "No-one. I'm my own teacher." This is a lonely youth for whom the programme has been the first place which has provided guidance and rounded care. It has changed him and his path in life. The supervisor's comment on these youth is insightful: "If you just get inside of them, they are very tender, very soft."

For the interns, the Site Supervisor is 'tops'. In the focus group discussion all the males agreed with the following sentiments or expressed others that were similar: "Out of everybody, Mr. Simon is di best! We gravitate to him. Him teach us pon di site. Everytime him seh sumting, wi pay attention to him. Him gi wi life lessons and advice. All a di lecturers do a good job, but Mr. Simon leaves a lasting impression. He's hands on [down] Best Supervisor!"

Economic Problems

The stipend, twice what most HEART trainees receive, is a certainly a tremendous assistance, but never in their interactions with the psychologist or the coordinators do the interns refer to economic problems. This is interpreted as a need to protect their family from the shame that Jamaicans tend to associate with poverty. So it is a matter of family pride. However their

¹² When they use to do their Thursday practical work, taught by a lower level supervisor, they would often rturn to their classroom after lunch.

need is seen on the rare occasions when the stipend is late. This is always due to a breakdown in the NCB Quisk. The interns become very upset. Some become livid, blaming everyone from the Gores, Intern Coordinators, the Junior Security Manager and down. On the first occasion that this happened, some did not attend class the next day. It is known that several have part-time jobs or entrepreneurial projects. According to the JSM, this stipend enables a number of them to provide much needed support to their families.

The Coordinators have realised that cooperation is much more forthcoming if it affects their pocket. For example, at the beginning a group of them refused to clean the classrooms: "That's not our job!" Their behaviour suggested a sense of entitlement as well as the common culture of ascribing a low status to persons doing certain types of work and vice-versa. This behaviour only changed when their stipend was reduced as a result of their refusal. GFF now provides monthly incentives for 1. Top Intern (academic performance, attendance, cooperation) - \$2,000; 2. Consistent attendance - \$1,000; 3. Cooperation - \$1,000. An intern may also get it for excellent attention to cleaning. When the interns complained about the lunches, Mrs. Gore just stopped providing the lunch because their attitude suggested they saw it as an entitlement rather than as a courtesy, like the provision of transport. Of course they stopped complaining and it seems that the food did become more seasoned and flavourful. So they were listened to, but their manner was inappropriate.

One-day Outings

Many inner city youth have travelled little outside their community except to go to school. Very few have

experienced landscaped parks, green

spaces, tree filled areas, the mountains. These experiences take them to a world far removed from the noisy crammed housing, little yard space, narrow streets, garbage strewn corners, the gunshots and bare no-man's-lands where war has obliterated former buildings and signs of human

We could see the whole city; it was completely breath-taking.

Holywell were eye-openers and greatly appreciated. These experiences are a form of therapy and show a liberating world outside their daily experience. ¹³ The callouts show some reflections on Holywell by female and male interns.

life. So the three visits to Emancipation Park, Hope Gardens and

It's a quiet space where you just hear the trees and birds.

The forest was

peaceful, the scenery

was beautiful...

The Mentorship Programme

The Mentors are all Gore scholars and all Gore scholars come from inner city areas, so they seemed the obvious choice for the programme. The Special Projects Consultant was able to contact 50 to ask if they would be interested in volunteering and 20 agreed. The psychologist made the final selection and she and Mrs. Gore ran an orientation session on Zoom.

¹³ The Victim Support Division of the Ministry of Justice use similar outings for traumatized children and adolescents

Feedback on the mentorship programme supports Mrs. Gore's description of it as "a mixed success". This is based on feedback from the interns, the mentors themselves, the psychologist who matched the mentors with interns, and the Special Projects Consultant. who knows some of the mentors personally from university and who is close in age to many. Only one intern out of the nine who were present on the day of the focus group discussion¹⁴ felt connected to their mentor and spoke to them regularly, once a fortnight. The psychologist reported that at least two of the 12 interns have had good relationships. Mrs. Gore has taken over one or two. Most interns said they did not feel connected and could not remember when they last spoke. Two of the seven male interns said they would have preferred to have a female mentor: "Ooman listen betta 'dan man all di time." The psychologist referred to the "fragile masculinity" of some. She also commented that most youth have never had this kind of relationship. The facilitator of the male interns' focus group discussion, who has had years of experience interacting with, and mentoring, inner city youth, feels it is extremely important for a male to have discussions with them on masculinity, on what it means to be a 'real man' in Jamaica. He comments that there are some "toxic views" associated with the need to be 'macho' which have to be "interrogated and demythologised" with them, just as it is important for a woman to have discussions with the female interns on what it is to be a 'real woman' in Jamaica.

Several of the interns had never met their mentor face to face and find it a problem to share personal feelings with someone they have not even seen. Some mentors were unable to attend the initial lunch for interns and mentors. Others mentors are overseas, although for at least one this did not create a problem. Another mentor is in Montego Bay and her mentee, who has not met her, cannot even recall when they last spoke. One male intern had asked his female mentor for a picture as he said he wanted to know who he was talking to. Her response suggested to him that she was offended. Not all interns having met their mentors face to face was certainly one of the problems. Another, suggests the Special Projects Consultant, is that some mentors do not invest enough time in the process as they have their own struggles. Some are still doing their first degree.

The six mentors who agreed to participate in the focus group discussion (FGD) with the evaluator wanted to mentor as part of giving back. Their Gore scholarship had a huge impact on their lives: "...I was unable to register for my last semester - a blessing"; "I was packing my bags"¹⁵; "Doing the degree very challenging - Gore did a lot for me and impacted me"; "Student loan in the first year, family has spent everything they could in second – but couldn't start the final year until the Gore scholarship saved me." "A necessity - would not have been able to pursue my master's otherwise." Some had already had good experiences of being mentored at school while others wished they had had someone to help them with stress.

¹⁴ It was a Friday. Three were absent, one at a funeral.

¹⁵ This former scholar has just received his Ph.D. from the University of Alabama.

¹⁶ This former scholar was the 2016 Jamaican Rhodes Scholar

The three female mentors had mixed experiences. Two had found it difficult to have a conversation with their intern. In one instance, in what should have been a perfect fit since both mentor and mentee came from the same community, the intern stopped communicating during August. Another told his mentor that he did not want to share. In a third case the female intern was very "guarded" and had a phone issue as she was using her mother's phone. Later the mentor got one from a friend to give her, but she has not been able to contact her since December. They met twice, once at the luncheon and once on site. In fact this is the female student who dropped out, had a poor performance record and had shown disrespect to both Mrs. Gore and an Intern Coordinator who had offered to help her online on the weekend. Clearly the mentor did not know that she had dropped out.

The three male mentors in the FGD were all still in touch with their mentees.¹⁷ They communicated one or twice a month. One noted that his mentee opened up when he had problems, although he was usually not very talkative. Another said a challenge was that neither he nor his mentee were talkative but he had shared when he was threatened by another intern. The third, who is overseas, said he had a generally good rapport, his mentee responds to messages and he has seen a lot of improvement. The intern has a good outlook on life and "a big personality".

Dealing with School and Training

The psychologist notes that the lack of motivation that some interns exhibited is really aligned to a sense of hopelessness. This was connected particularly with their school experience through the pandemic. For many "school wasn't there for them." The coordinators have spent a lot of time and effort helping a number of them complete their CSEC syllabus. In June for the four taking CSEC exams and especially in September for another three, school was really a challenge as they found it difficult to balance CSEC studies with this course. To assist them with their studies they were given time off, e.g. 3 days of school, 2 days at the training centre, with no change in stipend, and the ICs provided extra online tutoring in maths and English.

The two who dropped out of the course, the youngest, a 16 year old girl, as well as a 17 year old boy, left for that reason but, unlike the others, they were very 'laid back'. This could of course be a manifestation of the lack of motivation and hopelessness referred to by the psychologist. It is also the view of the ICs that the youngest intern, could not take the pressure of school and the training. Both she and the young man who dropped out were cousins. Of the four who took exams in June, all got their subjects and one girl excelled.

The ICs' view is that interns should be taken into the programme after they leave high school, not in their CSEC year. It is too stressful for them. It is also a strain for the ICs. The JSM, who thinks this is "a fantastic programme", does not agree. He thinks the programme helps to give many the motivation and discipline to deal with their schoolwork, although he thinks that it is very hard on the coordinators.

¹⁷ The focus group discussion was held on Feb 9, 2022.

The Expulsion and the Dropouts

The young woman who was expelled in November started by having a verbal altercation with another female intern (the most academically brilliant) who answered her back. The latter had to be taken away to calm her down. Both were penalised by the removal of one day's stipend. On the second occasion she left the bathroom door open (it had 2 doors) while the same girl was on the toilet. On both occasions she refused to acknowledge the breaches. The ICs tried unsuccessfully to mediate. Her attitude was negative, they said; she was not pleasant to be around. The Junior Security Manager said she was an instigator, very divisive and "a big manipulator". After this incident she was suspended with no stipend for a week and had a mandatory session with the psychologist. She then started to absent herself without giving notice (interns should phone to explain their absence). She would wear inappropriate clothes, breaching the dress code, wearing a mini skirt or ripped jeans – her 'excuse' was that she wanted "to look sexy". She was sent a final warning letter: any more breaches and you are out. She was expelled after continuing to absent herself and breach the dress code when she came.

In the opinion of the JSM she should have been expelled earlier because she was very manipulative, something the psychologist also identified. She disrespected the teachers more than once. The young woman herself agreed in talking with the JSM that she should admit her breaches but refused:" "Yes I should, but I won't". Clearly if you cannot bring yourself to change that approach in the programme, you will not survive. As one intern noted: "If yuh have a hard time wid di Code of Conduct, don't tek di programme." Since that "Things have improved exponentially", says the psychologist; she was jeopardising the others, she had to be expelled. She was a survivor. and with hindsight the psychologist said she would have intervened earlier. According to the JSM, the whole atmosphere "improved by leaps and bounds" after the expulsion.

The ICs noted that she had a strong personality and most interns were afraid of her. At 23 years, she was one of the oldest. The ICs knew that she did not live in Rose Town with her family, that most were abroad and that her mother apparently lived in Clarendon. What the ICs did not know at the time was that the rumour around her was true – the boyfriend she lived with was a gunman. Given this connection, it was not surprising that the other interns feared her.

The young woman who dropped out had a very poor performance record and was disrespectful. She was always behind in her work, constantly distracted by her phone, had a poor attendance record and never sent in sick leave certificates, due after three days absence. She had potential but apparently could not take pressure. When she was late with her work and the male IC offered to help her on the weekend by phone, she was disrespectful. When Mrs. Gore came to speak with the group, she started speaking on her phone and refused to discontinue when asked by Mrs. Gore. The female IC spoke found her mother on phone very passive in her response when she phoned her about her daughter's behaviour. She left in late January 2022 after a few days of attendance.

¹⁸ There was some confusion as to whether she was also now abroad.

The young man who eventually dropped out had been absent since school started back in September. He was supposed to work in December, when there was a long holiday, in order to catch up with the others. He did not come in. When he returned in January but there was too much for him to catch up with. He had basically abandoned the programme.

2. An Online Learning Process is an appropriate learning process for the interns.

The online learning process enables the learner to learn at their own pace. Once they are at the appropriate academic level, minimum Grade 9 in maths and language arts, they can engage. Unless the learner has external problems, s/he can always pass, since at every testing point, if the learner has not mastered the material, they are sent back to the redo the module to rectify their mistakes. So every learner can pass. The courses are free but not the certification. On graduation GFF will pay for the certificates for each of the 25 online courses they have completed.

The course groups on the next page show that the first two groups (eight courses in all) focus exclusively on life skills and academic preparation. Reading their Reflections it is clear that the Orientation Courses, especially the first on Coping with Stress, had some immediate impact. The many insights including such as not talking negatively about yourself, not allowing the past to influence your future, the importance of attitude, finding happiness within yourself, that emerged in this course, could be reinforced by the ICs and the psychologist from time to time. They should be certainly familiar with this course as well as the Foundational Course on Conflict Resolution, which also obviously impacted a number of interns when you read their Reflections. These teachings should also be reinforced by the ICs and the psychologist as appropriate.

These courses are followed by eight foundation skills for construction, some of which, like Customer Service and Safety and Health, also build directly on life skills, while the final nine courses are directly concerned with different construction skills.

One of the most popular guest lecturers ("Had a likkle vibes—it neva' boring"), a successful Human Resource (HR) Director in the hotel industry, who led two sessions online from an island in the Eastern Caribbean, expressed some uncertainty about the value of online courses. Her sessions were on Business Etiquette and Professionalism, which they had already taken as an online course. Very few were able to answer any of her questions on the course, although one has to recognise that students can 'freeze up' when asked a direct question like this from a new lecturer. She later had to explain to them that there is no "wrong answer" and that in her classes it had to be a two-way street between the teacher and the trainees. She herself brought 'etiquette' down to the real-life level of the home and thinking of others, and 'professionalism' about always being your best and keeping each other's secrets. She also recognised that perhaps this course, as presented online, might have been in the least familiar language and setting for this group.

¹⁹ The Evaluator read their Reflections on five courses, including all the Orientation Courses, and on their outing to Holywell.

1. Orientation Courses x 3

- Coping Skills Freedom from Stress and Pain
- Introduction to Microsoft 2019/365
- Succeed With Learning (study skills)

3. Foundation Courses x 8

- Outdoor Recreation and Land Management
- Productivity and Waste Management –
 Lean and Environmental Perspectives
- Fundamentals of Project Management
- Construction Safety and Health
- Safety in Construction: Fall Hazard
- Customer Service Skills
- Introduction to Project Management
- Introduction to Technical Drawing

As already indicated, each intern had to do a reflection on every one of the 25 courses.

2. Prerequisite Courses x 5

- Everyday English 1
- Everyday English 2
- Business Etiquette and Professionalism
- Soft Skills for Professionals
- Conflict Resolution in the Workplace

4. Specialty Courses x 9

- Diploma in Carpentry Studies
- Introduction to Masonry
- Diploma in Plumbing Studies
- Diploma in Electrical Studies
- •AutoCAD: Beginner to Professional Training
- Critical Facility: Critical Infrastructure
- Tiling
- Painting
- Diploma in Garden Design and Maintenance

3. At the end of the course the trainee outcome should be a mature individual, ready for the working world

To what extent have the interns, most of whom had few social graces when they started, who came from a divided community, for whom there was little experience outside of their community, progressed and matured? If they are to be successful in a career and upwardly mobile, this is vital. We start by looking through the eyes of the Intern Coordinators who have been with them every step of the way and add the inputs from the other stakeholders. What have they seen?

• The community division is now irrelevant – it was soon left behind. The interns themselves attest to this ability now to get on with others: "Learn teamwork. Wi come from different communities, and we are now friends. We learn how to work together." "It's helped me to deal with different personalities; it's preparing you for the work world." The Rose Town Foundation Executive Director has also witnessed this. When they get off the bus they are talking together, they walk in groups.

- Their exposure to other spaces on trips has helped them to realise that their community is not the only world there is in Jamaica.
- They realise they are now better positioned to get a job the course has added value to their lives. When they go on site they learn skills; many now want to go into some aspect of construction or landscaping. "Man provide for family and dis program is giving us di skills soh wi can do just dat." The psychologist also attests to them starting to believe there is life after the programme; at first they had joined just for something to do (in the focus group discussions almost all the interns, male and female, said this). She hears a lot more ideas on what they would do after the programme. The Junior Security Manager says it has helped some find their passion.
- Soft skills have improved. There are more greetings of good morning or afternoon. "They were very rough at first." This is a comment from one male intern: "When mi just come a bare back-talk. Now dat change. Understand mi role and change dat. Know mi role and responsibility from point A to point B." There is still work to do but they are heading in the right direction.
- We see them getting more confident, less shy, coming out of their shell with guest speakers. Some will now volunteer to give the vote of thanks. "I am more focused, pushing away any doubts. It has made me feel confident to attain my goals." The psychologist finds "They are opening up more". The RTF Executive Director of the Rose Town Foundation has also noticed this increase in confidence and articulation.
- Learning to take a customer service attitude through sessions with the lecturer on Business Etiquette and Professionalism trying to be a giving person:
 - "It change ghetto yute mindset mi was cruff and now mi use mi conflict resolution skills fi nuh war wid people. If conflict resolution was something taught in my community, violence would down, mi believe dat."
 - "If I have any issues, I put them aside."
 - "Behaviour attitude, self-regulation attitude biggest change."

Mr. Simon Edwards has been with them almost once a week on site and is now with them every day as Site Supervisor, teaching or refining their practical skills. In his words "This programme has changed the lives of these kids!". He says they have to "step out of the Rose Town box", the lifestyle of the inner city where:

- you do things your way
- you don't have to work today if you don't feel like it
- you don't think of others, there are no social graces.

As he warned them at the beginning of the site work, in the world of work this lifestyle will not work; you will get burnt. He says they are still learning because they had no guidance before. People never told them they were doing something wrong. This is why he advises that keeping in touch with them, following them up 6-12 months after the programme, will be crucial. They will still need support

4. They must have mastery of more than one construction skill

The GFF wants each intern to graduate with more than one skill, so that they have a choice as well as greater opportunities for consistent employment. The Foundation wants to put them on a path "to achieve a secure future for themselves". Mrs. Gore describes construction skills as a "Team Sport" – you work together but in many different skill areas from autocad on computers to steelwork to masonry to tiling to landscaping.



Right now, says Mr. Edwards, two male interns are practically ready for employment in terms of their skills in what they have done so far on site and their attitude. He is impressed with another young man who always wants to learn, has tenacity and determination. Others always work, are fully involved. One of the girls is not physically strong but she works when she can. She wants to get a degree in a science area and has the academic qualifications for university; and quite possibly a scholarship. Another girl is a team leader; she eventually wants to do land surveying. A male team leader who is physically strong, but currently injured (from football), controls the mixing board. Some would make good supervisors. One youth, who has always lacked confidence, has improved "by 500%" since he has been

on site. While not the most talented, he will definitely be able to get a job as a construction worker.

The interns have covered landscaping, excavation, trench support and steelwork. They are now practicing masonry and are about to start carpentry, rough casting and roofing. After this will come door and window framing and installation. Finally there is rendering, tiling, and painting. Says Mr. Edwards, "I enjoy the journey with them."











Results and Recommendations

The Gores have not set themselves an easy task – it does indeed take "incredible effort" on everyone's part as one of the stakeholders, the Head of the Security Firm, commented. The great majority of inner city youth, unless they have been influenced by relatives from 'crime yards', a phenomenon known to every inner city resident, want skills, want a profession and want to earn a good wage legally like every well-thinking citizen, and to build a life for themselves and their children. However the odds are stacked against them: a poor education system in most basic, infant and primary schools in inner city areas, because they are underresourced and because many teachers will avoid schools in areas associated with violence. Professor Orlando Patterson, Chair of The Jamaica Education Transformation Commission (JETC), appointed by the Prime Minister in 2020, in their recently submitted report "pointed to the dismal Primary Exit Profile results of 2019, which showed that about 60 per cent of students were failing in mathematics, 33 per cent of the cohort could not read, 56 per cent could not write, and almost 60 per cent could not identify the topic in a sentence."²⁰

As a result most will transition to non-traditional high schools in their own areas, suffering from the same lack of financial and human resources; some principals will tell you it is an "apartheid system". ²¹ All the young people who were selected for this programme had to be at Grade 9 Level or above, some with CSEC, and two with CAPE. They could not have managed the programme otherwise.

There is another set of odds: the culture of the inner city does not prepare its youth for the highly structured formal employment system. The inner city lifestyle is one of survival: hustling subsistence from day to day; dependency on family overseas to send money via Western Union; a tendency to succumb to 'BRAFF - Broke Right After Foolish Flossing', i.e. spending too much of the scarce money going to party because this is seen by many as essential for de-stressing and keeping sane. Smoking, drinking and partying disrupt stress and depression. You may be hungry some days — may have to sleep it off - but hopefully satisfied on others. Youth anywhere are particularly susceptible to a life of late nights, reasoning, listening to music, partying. On occasion that can be beneficial but not as a substitute for work. There is nothing consistent about this lifestyle. Only for a few youth will it provide the motivational impetus for success through hard work and innovation in entrepreneurship or in the creative arts, in order to escape the grind of poverty.

The stress will arise not only from the gunshots and killings – devastating experiences when it impacts persons close to you - but also from the social problems that arise in family relationships and circumstances and which are magnified by poverty. Intimate partner violence with father or boyfriend beating mother, screams of children of neighbours or within the family from brutal beating, constant verbal abuse, quarrelling and fights, are all too familiar sources of stress. This is an environment in which civility and dignity are scarce.

²⁰ Alphea Summer. "Extreme inequality: Education Commission says high school exit exams results unreliable". Jamaica Observer, January 14, 2022.

²¹ Personal conversation in 2020 of the Evaluator with the Principal of a school in an inner city area.

School will normally provide – or try to provide - the discipline of punctuality, attendance, some social graces, consistent hard work, and the experience of reward for this consistency. A favourite teacher or a guidance counsellor will provide a sympathetic ear, someone to talk to about troubles, someone who can offer some advice.²² This is why taking youth while they are in school, or immediately after they leave, is ideal. In June 2021, however, Rose Town youth, like all youth across Jamaica, had not attended school for over a year. So the progress towards developing social skills, thinking of others, mature behaviour was bound to be even more difficult.

How effective has this programme been?

When measurement was discussed, it was pointed out that the pre-conditions for a standard measurement of whether this intervention has worked were not documented; they were only in the heads of the sponsors, Christine and Phillip Gore (see pp. 10-11). Nevertheless it is possible to give a valid assessment, based on the participation of a wide group of stakeholders, of the objectives they set for the programme. Because this is only a mid-term evaluation - strictly speaking the interns had covered eight months or two thirds of the programme when this evaluation started in February – it is not possible to give a full assessment of some objectives.

A. The Learning Environment is a comfortable welcoming technologically effective environment

On almost every score GFF has provided a comfortable welcoming and technologically effective environment. Not only has the classroom itself, with computers, headphones, and air-conditioning, been comfortable and welcoming to a technologically driven generation, but GFF has ensured that the interns come to work in their own special air-conditioned bus so that the stress and cost of route taxi and bus is avoided²³. A breakfast snack and a full cooked lunch has been provided in a space especially prepared for them. They are provided with polo shirts and caps for classes and now boots, helmets, gloves and reflective safety vests with fluorescent strips for the construction site. They are provided with a full cooked breakfast now that they are working all day on the construction site.

For the entire period interns have been provided with a stipend of \$10,000 per fortnight, double what is provided to most HEART trainees, in a programme that does not require any expenditure on their part for lunch or bus fare. This has given them a level of independence and the capability to provide some help to their family. This is particularly important for the confidence of those who are adults, i.e. 18 years and older, 11 out of the 15 interns. One cultural pattern in the inner city practised by some families is to throw out a son once he becomes an adult – the rationale being that there are other mouths to feed and he is old enough to fend for himself. Others will insist a daughter lives with her boyfriend once she is

_

²² Although it mut be noted, as research undertaken by the Evaluator in another project has revealed, some teachers, particularly at high school level, can be very negative in their attitude to students

²³ Phoenix Park is in Salt Pond, St. Catherine, a 21 km drive from Kingston.

16 or over. These families may be in the minority but reflect expectations that are held more generally.

Not only has a near perfect physical setting been provided, but also every effort has been made to provide guidance, counselling, and emotional support: from the Intern Coordinators, who are on spot, from a specially retained psychologist who is basically on call, from volunteer mentors, as well as from Mrs. Gore who has shown commitment to her 'parenting' role. This psychosocial aspect is completely missing from HEART who experience a 40-50% dropout rate among inner city youth.²⁴

B. An Online Learning Process is an appropriate learning process for these interns

This will be evaluated in three ways: by looking the aptness of its features for the target group; by looking at their response to it; and by looking at whether other stakeholders, specifically the Intern Coordinators and the Site Supervisor, find they have absorbed the learnings.

- i. **Features.** The online learning process enables the learner to learn at their own pace. Once they are at the appropriate academic level, minimum Grade 9 in maths and language arts, they can engage. This is important for a group like this who come in at different academic levels (from Grade 9 to CAPE); two interns with three CAPE passes were studying alongside two interns with no CSEC, no City and Guilds passes and no certified NCTVET (HEART) courses. Unless the learner has external problems, s/he can always pass, since at every testing point, if the learner has not mastered the material, they are sent back to redo the module to rectify their mistakes. So every learner can pass. This is important for building self-confidence, something most inner city youth lack in terms of their intellectual abilities.
- ii. **Response of the Interns.** All the interns said they liked the online courses, pointing out, when asked, which ones they liked most and which they disliked. In fact only one of the nine present at the focus group discussions mentioned a dislike for Landscaping and Design, because he did not see any personal benefit in it. With regard to the ones they liked, among the male interns they ranged from the construction specialities like Masonry, to Project Management "keep mind fresh", to Conflict Resolution "believe this can change 'round [the] community", Customer Service "learn how to look 'pon body language", and Emotional Intelligence. One of the two female interns said she liked all the Orientation Courses, while the other found all the courses educational.
- iii. Their absorption and application of course content. This can partly be assessed by their progress in social skills and in construction skills. Progress in the former will be discussed under the next objective. However it should be noted that one lecturer, who took them for two online sessions, was sceptical of how much they had absorbed from one of the online courses that she was reinforcing (see p. 22). Regarding their construction skills, after less than a month the Site Supervisor, who is supervising 11 on site, can clearly see the impact on "five or six "of them. He notes that these are the most

²⁴ From a discussion later 2021 with a manager of a HEART Institution located in the inner city and from other conversations with managers and staff from recent work on a government project.

advanced trainees on the site. He volunteered that, although he cannot comment directly on their theoretical knowledge, the group as a whole are "much better practically" than HEART trained workers. This could suggest better theoretical preparation but may also reflect better practical preparation on the one day a week – or both. It can also be noted that they still have more skills to practise on site, namely: carpentry, rough casting, rendering, roofing, door and window framing and installation, tiling, and painting.

C. At the end of the course the outcome should be a mature individual, ready for the working world

In a way, this is 'the \$64m question'. If the interns have not become far more mature the training will be wasted. They may find employment but they are likely to lose it, as so often happens with training courses for inner city youth.

Below is a summary of what the stakeholders have observed (see more details in the relevant section on pp. 23-4 under Findings):

- a. There is no longer any community division. It is now irrelevant. They know how to work as a team.
- b. They know there is a different world outside the inner city and that it has different rules of conduct and behaviour.
- c. They now recognise they are in a better position to get a job, that the course has added value to their lives.
- d. Their soft skills have improved.
- e. They are more confident, less shy.
- f. They are more independent.
- g. They are learning to take a customer service attitude, to think of others.

This is a mid-term evaluation. A complete assessment cannot be made yet. Everything, including the interns' own reflections, points to significant progress in maturity. The three persons who have supervised them most closely, the two Coordinators and the Site Supervisor, are clear that they have progressed, that the programme has had a very big impact on their lives and on their maturation. They are also clear that they have not reached the point yet where all of them can step into the working world as mature young men and women. The Site Supervisor is firm – even after graduation in three months' time, they must be monitored, GFF must stay in touch, "follow them up", for six to 12 months, depending on the individual.

D. They must have mastery of more than one construction skill

To date, in constructing the Scheme Community Centre, the interns have covered the following skills:

- ✓ Landscaping
- ✓ Excavation
- ✓ Trench Support
- ✓ Preparing Surfaces

- ✓ Steelwork
- ✓ Masonry

The remaining skills to be covered are

- > Carpentry
- Rough casting
- Rendering
- > Roofing
- > Door and window installation
- > Tiling
- Painting

They are also given the opportunity by supportive regular employees, in consultation with the Site Supervisor, to drive equipment if they show interest.

The Site Supervisor is satisfied to date.²⁵ He can identify two interns who are near mastery in what they have covered, just needing more practice. There is only one intern who worries him and that is the young woman who has been absent grieving over the recent murder of her father and step-brother. She still receives her stipend and she is being assisted by the Intern Coordinators as she says she needs to go into employment after the programme ends. The Site Supervisor is otherwise confident that the interns will have covered more than one skill. This is important as at least half plan to go into construction. Whatever their future plans, progress so far indicates that at least 11 of the 12 interns will have mastered more than one construction skill.

In the meantime, under Mrs. Gore's leadership, the Intern Coordinators are ensuring that the interns are given the opportunity to go into further development programmes. GFF's objective is that all achieve further qualifications before going into employment in order to open the possibility of a higher quality of life. One has been accepted into the University of Technology (UTech) to do Pharmacy in line with her goal and another into Mico University College to pursue her goal of qualifying as a teacher of Mathematics. Several have been accepted into the army where they may choose to specialise in construction skills if they wish. Others will be taking courses to qualify for the Land Surveying degree at UTech or to qualify as Site Managers.

The President of the Incorporated Master Builders Association of Jamaica (IMAJ), who the Evaluator interviewed, expressed great interest in the programme and would like an opportunity to learn more about it. The IMAJ has an MOU with HEART and provides advice while their members facilitate their trainees with on-the-job experience.

²⁵ As at date of interview, 8 March 2022.

Recommendations

Recommendations for the Learning Environment

With hindsight, what might have been improved?

a. A more substantial snack for the first nine months and a cooked breakfast for their site work are needed from the perspective of the Evaluator. After the first few weeks, the latter has now been provided and the senior IC says they are no longer "hanging around" in the first hour or so waiting for their snack to be brought on site. The bus picks them up half an hour earlier at 7 am, they have their breakfast at 7.30 am, put on their gears and get directly into work. A good addition to the water provided is a semi-sweet liquid mixture in an igloo left on site that they can fill from an empty bottle. This is recommended by the Site Supervisor and is his voluntary contribution. It provides instant energy, easily sapped in rigorous physical work under the exceptionally hot sun resulting from climate change.

These youth leave their homes early in the morning without breakfast. Before this programme started they might have had tea and very few might have had something solid but insubstantial – a slice of bread or a fried dumpling.²⁶ Cognitive work requires at least a more substantial snack with some protein input. If this programme is repeated, here are some suggestions which would involve minimal cooking:

- One fruit (oranges, bananas, otaheite apples in season),
- Instant porridge (already provided),
- Protein (hard boiled eggs, or cheese and bun/raisin/cheese bread, or sardines with powder seasoning and cooked in microwave),
- Bread (already provided),
- hot drink (tea/coffee/cocoa/others if donated) (already provided).
- **b.** Enable the Intern Coordinators to be involved in interviewing applicants. They have a lot of experience in dealing with young people and would be an asset. It would give them more ownership over the entire process.
- c. Insert sessions on masculinity what it is to be a real man, and femininity what it is to be a real woman into the curriculum. For these sessions it is essential to find persons who understand inner city culture and who can converse with the interns in their native language, Patois.
- d. Reinforce the lessons from online courses in life skills, especially those in Coping Skills Freedom from Stress & Pain and in Conflict Resolution at the Workplace. The Intern Coordinators and the Psychologist should be familiar with these courses so that they can remind interns, on many of whom these courses obviously made an

²⁶ The Junior Security Manager, raised in the inner city, doubts any have breakfast before their normal 7.30 exit from Rose Town.

immediate impact. However time and memory can wane – they need to be reminded, for example on the need for all human beings to ask for help sometimes.

e. Involve the Interns in some aspects of discipline. It is always strategic to include students in some aspects of discipline as ownership encourages responsibility. Discussion on the Partner and Participant Guidelines should be encouraged at the Orientation by splitting interns into smaller groups to facilitate this. This should better inform GFF on any breach that they do not understand or that may have to be modified. Once the training programme has started, interns should be asked to develop the rules and sanctions for classroom behaviour. In these instances, teachers, in this case ICs, will have to guide, as often the students, used to authoritarian discipline, set very harsh rules that will not work.

f. Where possible simplify language and format in the Partner and Participant Guidelines. Suggestions:

- On page 1, remove "in not observing the requirements and meeting the expectations of the Program" in both instances
- On page 1, replace "deems" by "considers the" or "judges the"
- On page 1, remove "knowingly"
- Ensure "heading rows repeat" is entered to make for easier reading.

 Of course if any of these words are legally necessary these suggestions will be invalid.
- **g.** Consider a simple grievance procedure in an attempt to guide interns in how to deal with grievances at the workplace, such as the lunch complaints that occurred.
- h. Give authority to the Junior Security Manager (JSM) to enforce the dress code. One of the means by which the young lady, who was eventually expelled, was able to flout authority was by breaching the dress code wearing ripped jeans or miniskirts. For a whole day she could show her power by walking around in breach. If the JSM had the authority to turn back anyone from the bus if they were breaching the dress code, and at least for the first few occasions hold up the bus to allow them to go back to change, this could never have happened. It would in fact prevent this breach altogether, unless a trainee made their own way to the training centre.
- i. **Include the JSM in weekly meetings** about performance and behaviour as he also has insights. He is with the interns alone on the bus rides and some use him as a mentor. If necessary, enable him to attend this part of the meetings and deal with other confidential matters at the end, when he would leave.
- **j. Design the Orientation more as a workshop.** This would mean working with an experienced facilitator who is not connected with the programme. It means you have access to creative long proven exercises that can not only help to break the ice but also bring out issues that would not emerge from a PowerPoint and talk approach, although this will naturally form a part of the entire workshop. If a second course is run then one or two former interns should be invited to share their experiences and advice.

- **k.** Reorganize the Mentorship Programme. No doubt this is already in train if another course is contemplated. Possible considerations:
 - Ensure that mentors meet their mentees prior to starting the relationship, even if it means their mentorship programme starts late for some.
 - Do not use anyone who is still doing a degree or is in their first year in a job. They are unlikely to have enough time.
 - Try older persons, preferably those familiar with the programme, like Mr. Naransingh, Mrs. Ann-Marie Burke and Mr. Simon Edwards. Such persons are also very busy but are established in their profession and have mastered time management.
- 1. Stagger the Outings. This time they were all run close to each other. The value of these trips is not only to expose interns to different worlds but in taking them to new and positive environments it is also therapeutic, relieves tensions and facilitates bonding. So it makes sense to stagger them more; this is one safety valve for the tensions that inevitably build. A suggestion from the guest lecturer in landscape design and maintenance is to include a visit to a well organised manufacturer so that they can appreciate that there is a logical process, building step by step, in producing something. His suggestions were Elarc or Omni/Thermoplastics or Dairy Industries (if the latter is still operating).
- m. Extra-curricular activities. This was the suggestion of one intern, the only one, to the question "Do you have any recommendations/suggestions for changes/improvements in the next programme, if it happens?" "Everything good but what mi woulda add is extra-curricular activities." There is no space for physical activities but perhaps a once a month games afternoon with some light refreshments dominoes, ludo/'ludy' etc. or whatever interns suggested could be considered. Again this would be an activity to reduce tensions and increase bonding.

Recommendations for the Learning Process

With hindsight, what might have been improved?

a. The writing of Reflections. Many of the interns provided only one paragraph on a course. Usually the higher they had reached in academic achievement, the more they wrote. They often copied word for word extracts from the courses and from pamphlets they received about places they visited. As already indicated, it is an excellent way of reinforcing the learning as well as encouraging the practice of reflection. It is suggested, though, that more emphasis be placed on their own thoughts and responses – which is what reflection should be, rather than on too much exact copying of course content and information pamphlets. This could be incentivised by a certain percentage of marks for this, especially when they go on outings. Copying whole sentences and paragraphs written by others does not encourage independent critical thinking, does not place value on individual thinking - and inner city students are likely to have low self-esteem to start

with – and is not the most appropriate learning for the modern world.²⁷ It is acceptable to copy down points of fact from course content, but it is important to then try to formulate the significance of this and what is means to the learner/writer. This is a tall order because it demands a higher level of thinking, more hard work, more time, but it could be gradually incentivised by adding 5% at first, then 10% etc., perhaps up to as much as 50% depending on progress.

- **b.** Role play, quizzes etc. to help absorption of content. When the Intern Coordinator used role play after certain early courses she found interns became very engaged and enjoyed it. When learning can be made fun higher levels of absorption occur so methods like role play and quizzes should be heavily utilised.
- **c.** An in-depth conversation is needed on whether to take on schoolers. There are pros and cons and it may be that it depends on the individual. It needs a thorough discussion among the relevant stakeholders.

Other Recommendation

a. Hold a meeting with parents of selectees before the programme starts, with the assistance of the Rose Town Foundation. Have another meeting halfway through to update them on general progress. Parents want to be involved. Four parents of four randomly selected students (two males and two females) were interviewed by phone, three mothers and one father. In response to being asked "Would you have liked to have had a meeting at the beginning to inform you about the programme?", they emphatically endorsed this suggestion. In fact one parent raised this need before being asked. She was the most articulate and also had a fulltime job. She said that "Parents need to get a chance to know what is going on, what are the goals of the programme, what are the times of work?" Parents can support their children if they are more involved. Some youth will be coming from negative home environments - it will be harder to reach these parents but even more important. Many children and youth are subjected to frequent verbal abuse, an outcome not only of parental stress but of a feeling of anger that their child will not achieve, just as they feel they themselves have not achieved. This involvement should be done through the Rose Town Foundation whose Executive Director fully agrees with this recommendation. They should get some orientation at a community meeting from a GFF representative once their son or daughter has been accepted. Three said they would value an update at least once during the programme. It is understood that parents may be involved in preparations around the Live Build at the end of the programme so that they too feel part of the effort. If a video had been taken on site, at different stages, it could have been shown at the Live Build ceremony to give them a more tangible understanding of the programme.

_

²⁷ It is in fact plagiarism, and at tertiary level in the academic world it is heavily sanctioned.



Conclusion

This mid-term evaluation can conclude with conviction that this programme has to date been effective. The interns have undoubtedly matured: in self-confidence, a fundamental requirement for optimal learning and self-development, in their understanding of the discipline and behaviour needed for the world of work, how to work as a team, how to see things from the perspective of others – in other words in their life skills, the most important objective for the Gore Family Foundation. It is clear, from the testimony of their impressive Site Supervisor, that they are well on their way to mastering a range of construction skills. One only has to observe them on the building site, even as a lay person, to recognise that this is happening. There are one or two experienced construction workers around as back up to ensure a timely completion, but they are very much in the background.

At this point it would seem that 11, and possibly all 12, of the original 15 interns will have a successful graduation, a completion rate of 73-80% with a corresponding dropout rate of 20-27%. This is a significant achievement given the many problems faced by this target group. As indicated, HEART facilities experience a 40-50% dropout rate among this group, although their overall dropout rate is 11%.²⁸ They have none of the psychosocial support that this programme provides. Moreover the likelihood is that these interns will enter the workplace with a higher skill and educational level, if they are able to pursue further training, and are therefore likely to experience early upward mobility in their careers.

Not to be underestimated, and yet to be assessed, is the ripple effect this course can have on the Rose Town community. For the immediate future it can be gauged more fully during the weeklong 'Live Build' exercise in Rose Town itself and the ceremony that follows, that will end this programme. What emerged from all four parent interviews and the interview with the youth leader was that this programme is not widely known across Rose Town. None of them had heard about the programme themselves. For one it came through someone who works at Rose Town Foundation, from another it came from someone who loves near RTF, and for two, someone told their child.

There is no question that a second course for another set of inner city youth would be welcome. The interns are fully in favour of this; they want others from their own and other communities to get this opportunity. The GFF will make this decision, of course, but in the long run there is always the question of sustainability (see Appendix 2) and of the huge need out there. How can this be tackled? One route would be a partnership in construction training with HEART. The innovations that GFF has introduced, including the online courses and the focus on psychosocial support²⁹, are to some extent wasted if they only reach a small group.

²⁸ From discussions referred to in footnote 20 on p. 27 and HEART/NSAT Trust Annual Report 2019-2020

²⁹ There are those in HEART who fully recognise the importance of psychosocial support and there are also signs that is is also true at a broader government level.

Final Recommendations

There are three general recommendations the Evaluator thinks are important, even critical:

- 1. Establishment of a monitoring, follow-up process for graduates for 6-12 months, depending on individual need. Although each graduate has made huge strides in maturation, it can be assumed that they will not receive the kind of family and peer support needed when they step into the adult world seeking employment or further training. GFF, to fulfil its own mission for these young people, needs to ensure this for a period, the length of which will depend on each individual. They have already set the stage for further training but wherever they are, the interns will need a familiar ear to talk to and an advising voice they trust.
- 2. Facilitation of NCTVET certification at the end of the programme. Whatever the misgivings about HEART training and however well-founded, the value of an NCTVET certification is that it is accepted in many US States and in Canada, because it is linked to the US based ANSI Accreditation Board.³⁰ Each graduate can request an assessment in the skills GFF, through Gore Developments Ltd., has certified as passed. However applicants will have to wait until sufficient numbers apply before assessments are done. If this is done through the Gore Family Foundation these assessments will happen more rapidly because of the numbers and will ensure that graduates do not procrastinate but take the time out to do this.
- **3.** The Gore Family Foundation needs to take documentation of its work more seriously. It should invest in documentation at the level of complete written records, stored digitally, such as were not available for information on the scholarships, and in a range of visual records: photos and videos of every project it is involved in. There are so many innovations that GFF has introduced into its programmes that need to be accessible in this way: the Reach Up and Learn, the Second Step, and the Mini Tennis programmes in Early Childhood Institutions (ECIs), so many aspects of its Rose Town Construction Internship Programme and other ventures. Without crassly 'blowing its own trumpet', GFF needs to share these with the appropriate government institutions and with the public in an effort to influence policy for national development.

³⁰ https://anab.ansi.org/about-anab/recognition https://www.nctvetjamaica.org/

Appendix 1: List of Interviewees

Christine Gore	Director, Gore Family Foundation	Jan 31, 2022
Ruth Jankee	Executive Director, Rose Town Foundation	Feb 1, 2022
Brandon Burke	Special Projects Consultant	Feb 2, 2022
Novelene Ragbar	Intern Coordinator	Feb 8, 2022
Errol Campbell	Assistant Intern Coordinator	Feb 8, 2022
Sherona Forrester	Mentor and 2016 Jamaica Rhodes Scholar	Feb 9, 2022
Antoinette Harris	Mentor	Feb 9, 2022
Rushaine Goulbourne	Mentor	Feb 9, 2022
Brandon Mighty	Mentor	Feb 9, 2022
Shavonique Morrison	Mentor	Feb 9, 2022
Andre Smith	Mentor	Feb 9, 2022
Tara Armour	Psychologist	Feb 14, 2022
Ann-Marie Burke	Human Resource Manager	Feb 15, 2022
Akino Lindsay	Junior Security Manager	Feb 16, 2022
Male Interns (7)		Feb 18, 2022
Female Interns (2)		Feb 18, 2022
Raam Naraysingh	Natural Resource Manager and	Feb 23, 2022
	Apartment Complex Manager	
Dr. Jason McKay	CEO, McKay Security	Feb 24, 2022
Simon Edwards	Site Supervisor and Community Liaison	Mar 8, 2022
	Officer, Phoenix Park	
Sheldon Henry	Rose Town Youth leader and former	Apr 1, 2022
	PMI Violence Interrupter	
Lenworth Kelly	President, Incorporated Master Builders'	Apr 13, 2022
	Association	
Shemeka Peart	Parent	Apr 14, 2022
Claude Wright	Parent	Apr 16, 2022
Lorraine James	Parent	Apr 18, 2022
Ionie Salmon	Parent	Apr 20, 2022

Appendix 2: Extract from "Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work", ILO Working Paper, 2004

What makes training for disadvantaged youth good? Close examination of numerous projects that have had a positive impact on young women and men lead to the development of several criteria for determining what makes a training practice for disadvantaged youth good. This list is not exhaustive but reflects broad categories and guidelines to be followed in order to maximize the opportunities for success. Criteria for determining what makes a training practice for disadvantaged youth "good"

- 1. Innovative: It has unique characteristics, which address the weaknesses in other training practices in addressing the disadvantaged youth; appeals to the interest of all stakeholders.
- 2. Feasible: It can, realistically, be implemented; there is sufficient support, funding, capacity.
- 3. Gender sensitive: Young women as well as young men are given a voice in all aspects of the development, implementation and follow-up of the practice to ensure that their interests are taken into account.
- 4. Responsive: The practice is consistent with the needs identified by young women and men; it has involved a consensus-building approach; it is responsive to the interests and desires of the participants and others.
- 5. Relevant: The practice contributes, directly or indirectly, to demands of the market and the needs of the participants.
- 6. Ethical: It is consistent with principles of social and professional conduct; it operates in accordance with international labour standards.
- 7. Effective: The practice actually makes a difference in addressing youth employability; the impact has been measured either formally or otherwise; the impact evaluation has been documented and made available to interested parties.
- 8. Efficient: Resources (human, financial, and material) are used in a way that maximizes impact.
- 9. Sustainable: The practice can continue after its initial piloting; its benefits, to the individual, the community, the economy and/or the society, are likely to continue to be effective over the medium to long term.
- 10. Replicable: The practice can be replicated in other situations or settings; it can be adapted to be useful in other situations or settings; some elements of a practice are useful for other programmes.
- 11. Upscaleable: The practice can be expanded to operate on a wider level (e.g. from community level to national level).

Note: The majority of the features arise from an analysis of over 50 successful practices, carried out in the preparation of this working paper. Some of these criteria have been adapted from Good practices: Gender mainstreaming in actions against child labour, International Labour Office, International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour, Geneva, Dec.

2002, and modified to accommodate the unique features of training programmes for disadvantaged youth.

Laura Brewer. 2004. "Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work". *Skills Working Paper No. 19*. International Labour Organization, Geneva.